



POSTER
MIRTO
McDONALD
ARCHITECTURE
PLANNING
PRESERVATION

DATE: October 22, 2020, **Revised October 23, 2020.**

TO: Jodie Brown, City of Tucson Historic Preservation Officer
Michael Taku, City of Tucson, Lead Planner, TPOCHC Coordinator

FROM: Corky Poster, Architect/Planner

RE: Statement of proposed rehab scope of work for rehabilitation, 141-147 West Simpson
As per UDC 5.8.9. 2. Barrio Viejo HPZ Historic Review process.

PMM has been asked by the Rollings family to provide the architectural/preservation services for the rehabilitation of the Simpson Rowhouses (141-147 West Simpson). These historic units will remain three residential units, with upgrades to the roof structure, doors, windows, exterior stucco, electrical systems, plumbing systems, mechanical systems, interior floor plans, appliances, cabinets, & finishes.

The adobe rowhouses, according to the Barrio Viejo Historic District Inventory Form (1977) date to "Pre-1886." The Statement of Significance describes these rowhouses as a "Very good example of Transformed Sonoran row houses. This group is among the most noble structures in the district." The Rollings family has owned the property for almost 50 years. The rowhouses have been vacant for an extended period of time and the Rollings family is anxious to get them back into residential use.

The exterior and the interior of the rowhouses have been severely damaged by rising damp through the adobe walls and the concrete floors. The rising damp has also severely damaged the plastered-over stone veneer and the sidewalk at the street level. The moisture causing the rising damp and the subsequent damage to the structure was attributed, by a finding of fact in a jury trial in Superior Court, to leakage from the City of Tucson public water distribution system. That trial awarded the Rollings family \$3.2 million in damages. However, the legal liability of the City of Tucson was overturned by the Arizona Court of Appeals, and the damages were never collected.

Now that these legal questions have been settled, the Rollings family wants to proceed with the rehabilitation of the interior and preservation of the exterior of the rowhouse structures. The lean-to structure in the rear (north, away from street) is shown on the *MapTucson* site as non-contributing, however it will be preserved as is, with the exception of roof structural repairs and the filling in of two small windows. The interior plan will be modified, but no adobe walls will be changed. The damaged concrete floors will be removed and new concrete or brick floors will be installed.

The exterior of the structure will be preserved as shown on the submitted drawings. In general, the damaged cement-plaster structure will be saw-cut up to a height equal to the sill of the windows. Adobes and stones will be repaired and a new stucco of the same composition as the existing will be applied back down to the sidewalk level and, at the top, feathered back to the undamaged plaster. A new thin finish coat to match will smooth out the transitions. The severely damaged concrete sidewalks will be removed and replaced by new concrete. The concrete stairs will be repaired and/or replaced with like. Within 1'-4" of the base of the adobe wall, a 3'-0" foundation drain will be installed, filled with 1.5" diameter washed gravel to allow underground water to drain to the west. The foundation drain will be topped with 4 rows of brick on sand to allow the adobe to "breathe."

The doors and windows will be replaced with new. The double-hung windows will be replaced with painted wood or vinyl-covered wood double-hung windows. The door frames will be rebuilt with wood jambs and the transoms will be reconstructed to their original height with fixed glass (similar to the western-most door). Exterior doors will be painted six-panel solid core wood doors. The gable roof will remain as is, with structural improvements to the trusses and to the roof-wall connection.

Itemized Design Elements

1. **Height:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. The height will remain the same. It is currently no higher than the tallest building in the Development Zone.
2. **Setbacks:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. The zero setback will remain the same. It is currently the same as most adjacent buildings in the Development Zone.
3. **Site Utilization:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. The site utilization will remain the same except for the addition of three small patios on the north side.
4. **Building Form:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. The building form will remain the same.
5. **Color:** The new skim plaster coat will be integral color of a greyish-beige, similar to its existing color.
6. **Landscaping:** No new in-ground landscaping is proposed. This is consistent with the historic use.
7. **Enclosures:** No new fences, walls, or other enclosure features are proposed, except for privacy corrugated 6' fence/walls giving privacy to the new back patios.
8. **Utilities:** All utilities to the building will be underground.
9. **Parking Areas:** The existing parking area to the east of the structure will be maintained and improved with new concrete apron and gravel finish on the parking area.
10. **Sign:** There will be no signage.
11. **General Design:** The building facades are going to be restored/repared to their previous style and finish. Surface wiring will be removed. Rising damp damage interior and exterior will be repaired. Concrete stairs will be repaired/replaced as necessary. Windows and doors will be replaced in-kind. Glass transoms over four doors will be restored with wood frame and fixed glazing. Rear addition will be structurally stabilized (adobe wall is out of plumb. Roof is failed in some areas.) Metal roof on gable structure will remain. Metal roof on lean-to structure will be removed and replaced after structural repairs. Interior will be substantially remodeled to meet contemporary code requirements. Wood walls and dropped ceiling will be removed. Failing/heaving concrete floors will be removed and replaced with concrete or brick. Two wood windows now falling on new wall lines near bathrooms will be filled in, indicating previous location.
12. **Roof Type:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. The roof shape and roof materials will remain the same.
13. **Surface Texture:** Plaster finish on adobe walls will match existing (sponge float.)
14. **Projections and recessions:** Building is a remodel of an existing structure. Recessions and projections will remain the same.
15. **Details:** Doors, windows, transoms, steps will match existing.
16. **Sidewalks:** Sidewalks are severely deteriorated and will be removed. WPA sidewalks are located east and west of this property, are in very good condition, and will remain the same. The sidewalks being removed are pours of inferior concrete done after the WPA concrete sidewalks, probably in the 50's or 60's. The combination of poor quality materials and water damage from rising damp has delaminated and destroyed the sidewalks in front of these rowhouses. The new concrete finish will match the WPA finish to the east and to the west.

In this project (our professional opinion):

- A. Exterior alterations and changes are minimal;
- B. Alterations are compatible with the structure's original design;
- C. There is no new construction
- D. Alterations or renovations visible from the street are minimal;
- E. There are no changes to original roof form. Building materials and detail changes are minimal;
- F. All construction materials are appropriate to the building and to the neighborhood;
- G. The size, shape, and materials of window and door openings are maintained; and,
- H. Any historical and distinctive architectural details remain.

- Property is being used as it was historically requiring minimal change to distinctive materials, features, spaces, and spatial relationships
- Historic character has been retained and preserved. Removal of distinctive materials has been avoided.
- No conjectural features or “false sense of history” have been done.
- We have retained any alterations that have acquired historical significance in their own right
- Distinctive materials, features, finishes and, construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship have been preserved
- Repair options have been fully explored before replacement is considered; where replacement is the only option, the new features match the old. Replacement of missing features has been substantiated by documentary and physical evidence.
- No chemical or physical treatments that would cause damage to historic materials have been used.
- There is no disturbance of ground so as to damage any known archaeological resources.
- There are no new additions/exterior alterations