

Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board Tuesday, January 25, 2022, at 7:00PM Virtual Meeting

# **Meeting Minutes/Legal Action Report**

# 1. Call to Order/Roll Call

Members Present: Michael Bell, Elaine Hill (Co-Chair), Carol Maywood and Chris Jech (Co-Chair)

City Staff Present: Jodie Brown

Guests Present: Debra Lazar, Stephen Bohn, Demion Clinco, Judith Clinco, David Pietz, Tim Kinney, and Mary Lou Fragomeni

A quorum was established, and the meeting was called to order at 7:04 PM.

Items were taken out of order.

## 2. Approval of Minutes/LAR: November 16, 2021

A Motion to approve the Minutes was made by Bell and seconded by Co-Chair Hill. The motion passed with a vote of 4-0.

### 3. Reviews

## a. 5230 E Fort Lowell Road

Window repair Courtesy Review/Individually Listed on National Register, Historic Landmark/Estimated time: 30 minutes

The applicant was not present at the meeting. Item was not heard.

## 4. Appeal of the Director's Decision Discussion

## a. Appeal of the Director's Decision for HPZ 21-061, 5440 E Presidio

Historic staff provided background on the review process and correspondence objecting to the proposed project. Staff also provided information on the appeal process.

Co-Chair Hill indicated that the board was familiar with the proposed project and asked that the neighbors voice their concerns with the plans. D. Clinco provided background on their history in the preservation zone, and their concerns with the proposed project as twofold – that the proposed project site utilization does not contribute, and that comparing project design to non-historic properties erodes and diminishes the preservation zone. Kinney, the attorney representing the Clincos, also discussed concerns with the project. Kinney indicated concerns about specific design criteria and the site utilization. He also provided a partial

history of the Contributing Non-Historic status. He indicated that it appears that the classification was added on June 10, 1995, to address demolitions, but it was not clear when the definition was changed in the UDC.

D. Clinco noted that there was no comprehensive documentation for the nonhistoric properties located within the Historic Preservation Zone (HPZ). Buildings within the National Register historic district have a context statement and inventory forms for each property that detail character-defining elements. Co-Chair Hill indicated that neighborhood had some documentation.

Bohn, architect for the project, spoke about the design and responded to comments in the objection letter. Hill indicated there were some errors in the Director response. Bohn indicated the owner will modify the colors and plant screening trees. Other design elements will be covered in minor review.

Co-Chair Hill addressed the role of the advisory board. She indicated that there was some difficulty in reading the plans online, assessing them in Zoom meetings and enlarging them. She stressed the need for courtesy reviews; that Staff should encourage these so that projects can be adequately evaluated. Bell and Maywood concurred with Hill's comments and felt that there was limited detailed design information provided for this project. Staff informed the board that all of the required documentation for review was uploaded to the PDSD website one week prior to the meeting. Staff also indicated that the online PDs could be enlarged. Co-Chair Jech added that they are not professionals and were trying to be good stewards for the preservation zone.

Co-Chair Hill asked that former board member Fragomeni comment on the proposed project. She commented that she was concerned about the trees and the poor condition of the perimeter wall.

Bohn noted that the wall looks to be primarily on the Craycroft Road property. He also indicated that the project area would be graded to address a drainage issue; that the guesthouse would be only 3-4 feet higher than the adobe wall. J. Clinco indicated that the wall repair was the responsibility of the Bosque Ranch HOA who built the wall at time of the development..

Co-Chair Hill made a motion to appeal in consideration of the request by neighboring properties that aspects had not been considered during the initial review including site utilization, color, setbacks, details not previously provided including gates, windows and doors, and compliance with the design guidelines. The motion was seconded by Co-Chair Jech. Staff requested clarification on the motion which was restated by Co-Chair Hill. Co-Chair Jech, as the seconder, concurred with the restatement. The motion failed (1-approved, 2-declined, and 1-abstained)

#### 5. Nominations for Board Membership

The board discussed Fragomeni rejoining the board as a member. Her required one year hiatus is complete. Co-Chair Hill made a motion to appoint Fragomeni to the advisory board. Co-Chair Jech seconded the motion and it passed with a vote of 4-0.

## 6. Review Process Issues

Concerns about the review process were noted in during item 4a.

### 7. Call to the Audience

None.

## 8. Staff Updates

Staff updated the board members on the Historical Commission separation and code update. Staff recommended that they attend the full commission meeting on February 9<sup>th</sup> to hear the presentation from the consultant working on the separation.

# 9. Future Agenda Items—Information Only

No updates.

### 10. Adjournment

Co-Chair Hill made a motion to adjourn the meeting which was seconded by Bell. The meeting was adjourned at 8:52 PM.