

CITY OF TUCSON

Historic Preservation Office (HPO)

Planning & Development Services Department (PDSD) Steve Bohn Architect, Inc. 2034 E 7th Street Tucson, AZ 85719 snsbohn@cox.net

Subject: HPZ 21-061, 5440 E. Presidio Road

Fort Lowell Historic Preservation Zone

Construction of a detached guest house and remodel of the main house

Dear Mr. Bohn:

The proposed construction of a detached guest house and remodel of the main house was reviewed by the Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board (FLHZAB) on November 16, 2021. The Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission, Plans Review Subcommittee (TPCHC, PRS) conducted their review on December 09, 2021. Both the Advisory Board and the Subcommittee made a recommendation to approve the project, with specific conditions, to the Planning and Development Services Department Director.

The proposed work was evaluated by both the advisory board and the subcommittee consistent with Unified Development Code (UDC) 5.8.

The house at 5440 E Presidio Road is classified as a Contributing Non-Historic property. UDC §11.4.4 defines this as, "A property within a Historic Preservation Zone, Neighborhood Preservation Zone, or National Register Historic District that contributes to the historic significance and visual character of the zone or district, and has sufficient integrity to convey that significance and those visual character defining features in terms of location, design, setting, material, workmanship, character, or association. Contributing Properties are historic sites or nonhistoric compatible properties." (Emphasis added)

Development Zone (DZ)—The DZ for this property includes properties on either side of E Presidio Road from Craycroft Road to the end of the cul-de-sac. The DZ includes two properties listed individually on the National Register (3095 N Craycroft Road and 3031 N Craycroft Road). The remainder of the homes along Presidio Road are classified as Contributing, Non-Historic and as such can be used for comparison to determine if the new construction is compatible.

Height (UDC 5.8.9.B)—The height of the proposed guest house is proposed for is 12'6" and the main house is 15'4" which is consistent with typical height within the DZ.

Setbacks (UDC 5.8.9.C)—The lots along Presidio Road are not uniform and generally smaller than other lots within the National Register Historic District. The setbacks vary within the DZ and support the proposed placement of the guest house. The lot is zoned HR-1 and the side and rear setbacks are 6' or 2/3 the wall height, whichever is greater. The proposed setback for the east elevation is 8'3" and the south elevation is also 8'3". The setbacks are consistent with other properties in the DZ.

Site Utilization (UDC 5.8.9.G)—The majority of the lots within the DZ are smaller and irregular compared to the two individually listed properties. The proposed guest house is consistent with the site utilization presented in the other Contributing, Non-Historic properties. The site utilization is compatible with other properties within the DZ.

Projections and Recessions (UDC 5.8.9.H)—The existing house has an irregular floor plan with a number of projections and recessions. Other Contributing, Non-Historic properties within the DZ have canopies and there are other homes with arches in the design. The Fort Lowell Design Guidelines also note that

Website: www.tucsonaz.gov • Email: pdsdinquiries@tucsonaz.gov

"Arched openings over the main entrance may be appropriate..." The proposed projections and recessions are consistent with the DZ.

Building Form (UDC 5.8.9.J)—The existing house has a varied footprint with several protrusions and recessions. Other properties within the DZ also have an irregular footprint. The roof line of the existing house steps similar to the proposed guest house. The building form is compatible with the other properties within the DZ.

Rhythm (UDC 5.8.9.K)—The existing houses within the DZ have multiple windows on each elevation. The guest house is similarly designed with multiple windows on each façade with the majority that are taller rather than wider. The southwest elevation which fronts a neighboring wall, and is not visible, is limited to only one window. There are a few proposed windows that are not taller than wider which lend themselves to the Fort Lowell Design Guidelines which indicates that there is no symmetry to the lay out of the windows. The rhythm of openings is compatible with other properties within the DZ.

Color (UDC 5.8.9.L.1)—The existing house is painted an off white/light tan color. The guest house is proposed to match the house. Homes within the DZ are a spectrum of tan and at least two of the homes have a similar color to the existing. The Fort Lowell Design Guidelines state that, "Colors should be soft earth tones of light to middle value." The proposed color is compatible with the DZ.

Landscaping (UDC 5.8.9.L.2)—Mature vegetation surrounds the property which consists of Mesquite trees and various shrubs. No new vegetation will be added, but 1-2 trees will be removed. The landscaping is compatible with the DZ.

Enclosures (UDC 5.8.9.L.3)—This section is not applicable.

Utilities (UDC 5.8.9.L.4)—The existing utilities are underground and will remain as such.

Motor Vehicle & Parking Areas (UDC 5.8.9.N)—The existing house has two garage bays. The proposed guest house will have a parking spot located between the buildings with limited visibility.

Signs (UDC 5.8.9.M)—This section is not applicable.

Architectural Character and Streetscape (Technical Standards Manual [TSM] 9-02.7.5.B) discusses the architectural character of the existing district. There are no requirements within this section. Neither the TSM or design guidelines require that new construction is adobe or masonry. There are also no requirements within the design guidelines that windows, or doors are deeply recessed. The windows on the proposed guest house will match the fenestration used on the existing house and consistent with other Contributing, Non-Historic houses in the DZ.

Pursuant to provisions of Section 5.8 of the City of Tucson Unified Development Code and the Secretary of Interior's Standards, the application has been:

APPROVED as shown on the plans and drawings dated September 17, 2021, and subject to the following conditions:

- 1) That, the six-inch steel posts shall include a bottom pedestal around the guest house porch support pillars;
- 2) That, a minor review shall be undertaken for the new entry door in the front of the main house, the glass around the sides and top of the new entry door on the main house, and the security gate:
- 3) That, the shade sails are eliminated from the plan;
- 4) Obtain the appropriate permits within one (1) year of the Director's decision.

The decision of the Planning & Development Services Department (PDSD) Director may be appealed by a party of record to the Mayor and Council by filing the appeal with the City Clerk's Office within

January 18, 2022

Fourteen (14) days of the effective date of the decision (the date of this decision letter) and paying the appeal fee at the PDSD on the same day the appeal is filed. Complete appeal materials must be filed with the City Clerk within thirty (30) days of the effective date of the decision. No building permit will be issued prior to the expiration of the appeal period on **February 1, 2022.** The issuance of a building permit by Planning & Development Services will be based on compliance with all applicable Zoning, Building Code, and Fire Code requirements.

Changes to the approved plans may require additional Historic Preservation Zone Development review. Contact Michael Taku at 837-4963 to determine the extent of review needed for changes.

Sincerely,

Scott Clark PDSD Director

SC: MT/ HPZ 21-061

c: Teresita Majewski, Tucson-Pima County Historical Commission, Chair Elaine Hill, Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board, Co-Chair Chris Jech, Fort Lowell Historic Zone Advisory Board, Co-Chair