May 27, 2014

Jim Mazzocco, Planning Administrator Urban Planning and Design City of Tucson 345 E. Toole Avenue Tucson, Az 85726-7210

Re: Design Changes to Park Avenue Housing

Dear Jim:

In response to the changes that occurred after the approved DRC design package, resulting in a different built out design, I am submitting my response and recommendations.

1. MGD ordinance regarding design changes:

a. The Ordinance does not appear to have a clear process regarding design changes that are made to the approved DRC and PDSD Design Package during the construction documentation phase or construction phase.

2. Review of Design changes based on the new design review process:

- a. Any proposed major changes made by the applicant after the original approved Design Package must be resubmitted to the PDSD for consideration of these changes.
- b. The following is my response and recommendations to the revision summary from Shepley Bulfinch dated 1 May 2014:
 - i. <u>Revision 1: Adding of Iconic Shade canopy.</u> I recommend approval. I see this as an aesthetic improvement.
 - ii. Revision 2: Replace Metal panels with synthetic stucco. I recommend approval, since the material is on the 12th and 13th floor levels.
 - iii. Revision 3: Reduction of glazing. If the City's proposal is to add additional glazing only on the East Elevation to make the final east elevation appear closer to the original approved DRC, the final east elevation design would not be sensitive to the built-out glazing design of the North and South elevations. It is my opinion to work with the design elements that are currently built out to make the east elevation work aesthetically and harmoniously with the other elevations. The built-out design should not be changed to just make it look like the DRC design on the east elevation.
 - iv. Revision 4: Balconies reduced to Juliet balconies. I recommend approval of Juliet balconies.
 - v. Revision 5: Change from Board formed conrete to colored fiber cement board panel. Located primarily on North, West and South Elevations. I recommend approval.
 - vi. Revision 6: Relocation of Storefront glazing. It appears that the glass on the south side which is adjacent to the parking lot was eliminated. Now there is no view into the parking lot, but the relocated storefront allows a view into a courtyard. I recommend approval.
 - vii. Revision 7: Change of shade trellis to tree shading. I recommend approval

3. Cohesiveness of the new design:

Project Name: Park Avenue housing tac#14018

Date: May 27, 2014

Page 2 of 2

Per the City's request, I visited the site, took photos, reviewed Shepley Bulfinch's original approved DRC design of the East Elevation and the current built-out design of the East Elevation.

a. The following is my observations and analysis of the east elevation:

- i. The east elevation of the DRC design had a heavy emphasis on horizontal elements with strong horizontal lines and glass window walls. The current design has strong vertical elements that contribute to a more vertical look. There has also been significant reduction in glazing and an amenity deck structure added to the SE roof. The two designs are totally different. So to now attempt to make the current built-out design with it's vertical emphasis have a more horizontal appearance would not be recommended. If changes are made to the current built-out design, any changes must be based on design elements that will enhance the current built-out design.
- ii. Having visited the site and studied the project from various angles along Park and Speedway, I recommend that the East Elevation should remain as constructed. I have attached photos taken that day.

4. Recommendation based on analysis:

It is my opinion that even though the architect changed the DRC Design to almost a completely different design, the built-out design is of a high quality design and appears to have more elements that are compatible with a "Tucson" design, than the approved DRC design.

I recommend the PDSD Director accept the current design without any changes.

5. Landscape design Revisions:

- a. I have reviewed a shade study drawing which is set at 2:00pm on June 21, from Carl Winters and Associates which shows the shaded areas from trees or the building along Park Avenue East of the Park Avenue Student Housing Project and a letter from Chris Winters which identifies the revisions to the approved development plan.
 - i. Recommendations regarding the shade along Park Avenue: It is my recommendation is to approve the landscape plan based on sufficient shading along the pedestrian side walk as shown in the shade study.
 - ii. Recommendations regarding the letter from Chris Winters dated May 19, 2014: I recommend approval of all items identified that are relevant changes to the landscape shading along Park Avenue East of the Park Avenue Housing Project.

Respectfully Submitted,

Richald Fe Tom, AIA, NCARB COT Design Professional Consultant

The Architecture Company