NPS Form 10-900 (Oct. 1990) OMB No. 10024-0018

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Registration Form

This form is for use in nominating or requesting determinations for individual properties and districts. See instructions in *How to Complete the National Register of Historic Places Registration Form* (National Register Bulletin 16A). Complete each item by marking "x" in the appropriate box or by entering the information requested. If an item does not apply to the property being documented, enter "N/A" for "not applicable." For functions, architectural classification, materials, and areas of significance, enter only categories and subcategories from the instructions. Place additional entries and narrative items on continuation sheets (NPS Form 10-900a). Use a typewriter. word processor, or computer to complete all items.

1. Name of Property						
historic name Barrio El Hoyo Historic Distric	: <u>t</u>					
other names/site number N/A						
2. Location						
street & number Roughly bounded by W. C south, S. 11th Ave. on the east, and S. Samanie	_				not for	publication
city or town <u>Tucson</u>						vicinity
state <u>Arizona</u> code <u>AZ</u>	county	<u>Pima</u>	code	<u>019</u>	zip code	<u>85701</u>
3. State/Federal Agency Certification						
As the designated authority under the National Historic Pr request for determination of eligibility meets the docu Places and meets the procedural and professional requiren meets does not meet the National Register criteria nationally statewide locally. (See contin	amentation nents set f a. I recon	n standards for regionth in 36 CFR Par Torth in 36 CFR Par Torth in the standard that the standard in the standards for region in the standard for reg	stering propertient 60. In my opin perty be consider	es in the Na nion, the pr	tional Registe operty	er of Historic
Signature of certifying official/Title	Date					
State or Federal agency and bureau					_	
In my opinion, the property meets does not comments.)	meet the	National Register	criteria. (See contin	nuation sheet	for additional
Signature of certifying official/Title						
State or Federal agency and bureau					_	
4. National Park Service Certification						
I hereby certify that the property is:		Signature of	the Keeper		Date of	of Action
entered in the National Register See continuation sheet						
determined eligible for the National Register See continuation sheet						
determined not eligible for the National Register						
removed from the National Register						
other (explain)						

5. Classification

Ownership of Property (Check as many boxes as apply)	Category of Property (Check only one box)		ources within Proper viously listed resources in the	•
x private public-local	building(s) x district	Contributing	Noncontributing	
public-State public-Federal	site object	68	28	buildings sites structures objects
		68	28	Total
Name of related multiple property listing (Enter "N/A" if property is not part of a multiple property listing)		Number of coning the National	tributing resources p Register	reviously listed
N/A		0		

6. Function or Use

Historic Functions

(Enter categories from instructions)
DOMESTIC/single dwelling, multiple dwelling
COMMERCE/TRADE/department store
RELIGION/religious facility

Current Functions

(Enter categories from instructions)
DOMESTIC/single dwelling, multiple dwelling
RELIGION/religious facility

7. Description

Architectural Classification

(Enter categories from instructions)

OTHER: Sonoran Tradition

LATE 19TH AND EARLY 20TH CENTURY

REVIVALS: Mission/Spanish Colonial Revival

Materials

(Enter categories from instructions)

foundation STONE, CONCRETE

walls ADOBE, BRICK, STUCCO

roof METAL, ASPHALT

other WOOD

Narrative Description

(Describe the historic and current condition of the property on one or more continuation sheets)

8. Statement of Significance

Applicable National Register Criteria

(Mark "x" in one or more boxes for the criteria qualifying the property for National Register listing)

- x A Property is associated with events that have made a significant contribution to the broad patterns of our history.
- **B** Property is associated with the lives of persons significant in our past.
- x C Property embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, or method of construction or represents the work of a master, or possesses high artistic values, or represents a significant and distinguishable entity whose components lack individual distinction.
- __ **D** Property has yielded, or is likely to yield, information important in prehistory or history.

Criteria Considerations

(Mark "x" in all boxes that apply)

Property is:

- __ A owned by a religious institution or used for religious purposes.
- **B** removed from its original location.
- __ C a birthplace or grave.
- **D** a cemetery.
- **E** a reconstructed building, object, or structure.
- **__ F** a commemorative property.
- __ **G** less than 50 years of age or achieved significance within the past 50 years.

Narrative Statement of Significance

(Explain the significance of the property on one or more continuation sheets)

9. Major Bibliographical References

Bibliography

(Cite the books, articles, and other sources used in preparing this form on one or more continuation sheets)

Previous documentation on file (NPS):

- preliminary determination of individual listing
 (36 CFR 67) has been requested
- previously listed in the National Register
- previously determined eligible by the National Register
- _ designated a National Historic Landmark
- recorded by Historic American Buildings Survey, No.
- recorded by Historic American Engineering Record, No.

Areas of Significance

(Enter categories from instructions)

ARCHITECTURE COMMUNITY PLANNING AND DEVELOPMENT

Period of Significance

1908-1950

Significant Dates

N/A

Significant Person

N/A

Cultural Affiliation

N/A

Architect/Builder

N/A

Primary location of additional data:

- x State Historic Preservation Office
- Other State agency
- Federal agency
- Local government
- University
- Other

Name of repository:

10. Geographical Data

Acreage of Property approximately 22 acres

UTM References

(Place additional UTM references on a continuation sheet)

	Zone	Easting	Northing		Zone	Easting	Northing
1	12	502177	3564441	3	12	502332	3564074
2	12	502372	3564442	4	12	502293	3563947

Verbal Boundary Description

(Describe the boundaries of the property on a continuation sheet)

Boundary Justification

(Explain why the boundaries were selected on a continuation sheet)

11. Form Prepared By

name/title Morgan Rieder, Historical Architect, Paul Farnsworth Ph.D., Paul Rawson, M.A.

organization William Self Associates, Inc. date December 19, 2007

street & number 2424 E. Broadway Blvd., Suite 100 telephone (520) 624-0101

city or town Tucson state AZ zip code 85719

Additional Documentation

Submit the following items with the completed form:

Continuation Sheets

Maps

A USGS map (7.5 or 15 minute series) indicating the property's location.

A **Sketch map** for historic districts and properties having large acreage or numerous resources.

Photographs

Representative black and white photographs of the property.

Additional items

(Check with the SHPO or FPO for any additional items)

Property Owner

(Complete this item at the request of the SHPO or FPO.)

name

street & number telephone

city or town state zip code

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 1

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description

Barrio El Hoyo is a small residential neighborhood, located southwest of Tucson's downtown. Barrio El Hoyo, together with the National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District (listed October 18, 1978), comprise the locally designated Barrio Histórico Historic District. The City of Tucson has viewed Barrio El Hoyo as having the same architectural and historical importance as the National Register-listed Barrio Libre. The current nomination is to provide comparable State and National Register recognition of the district's significance. It possesses 68 contributing resources and 28 noncontributing resources; contributing resources reflect good examples of properties executed in Sonoran Tradition, and one religious structure in Mission style. Noncontributing resources mainly reflect infill after the period of significance. The barrio's period of significance is from 1908 to 1950, which was chosen to reflect the period of the development of the neighborhood. The neighborhood retains a considerable degree of integrity of materials, workmanship, and a high degree of integrity in terms of location, design, setting, feeling, and association.

Barrio El Hoyo is located within walking distance of Tucson's downtown, to the southwest. The neighborhood is bounded on the north and northwest by the facilities of the Tucson Convention Center, on the west by industrial yards, on the southwest and south by Tucson Water facilities, and on the east by Barrio Libre Historic District, listed in the National Register on October 18, 1978. Other nearby barrios are Santa Rosa, to the south, and a remnant of El Membrillo, to the northwest. El Hoyo derives its name ("the hole") from its topography, because most of the neighborhood is on lower ground than the surrounding areas to the east and south. Until the late nineteenth century, this was cultivated land on the floodplain of the Santa Cruz River. In the early 1870s, Leopoldo Carrillo owned most of the property now occupied by Barrio El Hoyo and the area was developed as Carrillo's Gardens and, to the north, a ball field. In 1903, Emanuel Drachman purchased the Gardens after Carillo's death, and, in partnership with Alex Rossi, opened an amusement park under the name Elysian Grove. Elysian Grove finally closed in 1915 due to financial problems and the land was sold and subdivided.

Barrio El Hoyo was formed from three blocks—221, 243, and 245—of the original 1874 Tucson Townsite. Block 245, between 17th and 18th Streets, was divided by Osborne Street and platted by 1905, but remained part of the City of Tucson plat; building here began by 1908 (e.g. 715 S. 11th Ave.). After the demise of Elysian Grove in 1915, Block 243, between 17th Street and Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Elysian Grove subdivision; the plat was not filed until 1921, but lots were being sold and dwellings constructed from 1915 on. Most of Block 221, north of Mission Road (now W. Simpson Street), was platted as the Southwestern addition in 1920; in 1926, a portion of this addition was replatted as the Ball Park subdivision. The northern two-thirds of Block 221 was demolished in the 1970s for the Tucson Convention Center, but leaving two-thirds of the Ball Park subdivision intact. Approximately three-quarters of the barrio had been built by 1931, before the effects of the Great Depression; the remaining quarter was built during recovery from the Depression up to World War II, and in the immediate postwar years. Little or no home building took

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 2

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

place during the Depression years (for lack of funds) nor during wartime (for lack of materials). The barrio had been almost entirely built up by 1950; very little infill was constructed in the 1950s (5.2 percent of the total number of buildings in the present barrio). During the following two decades, the neighborhood underwent a period of decline and a number of buildings were abandoned and collapsed. The barrio's period of significance is, therefore, from the date of the earliest standing structure, 1908, to 1950, when the barrio had been almost entirely built up.

El Hoyo is one of Tucson's "suburban" barrios, although it was (and is) very different from the Anglo-American motor-car suburbs that were being built east of downtown. Suburban barrios such as El Hoyo and Barrio Anita (north of downtown) are defined as those that developed outside Tucson's late nineteenth-century core, roughly bounded on the north by Sixth Street, on the south by Eighteenth Street, on the east by the railroad, and on the west by Main Avenue (Husband 1988).

The buildings constructed in El Hoyo during its period of significance are a continuation of the Hispanic vernacular building tradition known regionally as Sonoran. (Until the United States' invasion of Mexico and the subsequent treaties of Guadalupe Hidalgo in 1848, and La Mesilla, in 1854, what is now southern Arizona was northern Sonora.) According to Nequette and Jeffery (2002), the typical, single-room adobe block house was the basic building unit of the early Sonoran house. In the second half of the nineteenth century this was a simple square or rectangle in plan, located at the front of the property line or street edge and contiguous with adjacent units. Shared walls saved time and materials. These rows lined the perimeter of the block, with a communal area in the center for gardening, cooking, livestock and outdoor living. A gate at the street allowed entry between units to the central area. In the late nineteenth century this gateway became enclosed as wide central hall called a zaguán from which other rooms were entered. A flat roof surrounded by a high parapet allowed people to sleep on the rooftops. Nequette and Jeffery (2002:272) state that there are no unchanged Sonoran houses, as all that have survived have been modified by American cultural attitudes and materials into what they call "Transformed Sonoran." Although small quantities of premanufactured building materials had been brought in by wagon freighters prior to 1880, the arrival of the Southern Pacific Railroad in Tucson that year enabled large quantities of these materials to be brought in. Bricks for coping, milled limber for window and door trim, as well as roofs, and tin for roofing were among the materials now widely available. The most common modification was the addition of a gabled or pyramidal roof.

New buildings also made use of the newly available materials. Nequette and Jeffery (2002) call these houses "Transitional." Transitional Sonoran style is the result of the transformation that occurred as Sonoran traditions began to incorporate non-Hispanic American traditions from the East. At the urban scale, this was manifested in changing land-use patterns. At the scale of the building, structures incorporated both traditions. Nequette and Jeffery (2002) identify two periods, early and

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 3

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

late. The earlier period is noted for simplicity and use of the Greek Revival pediment, while the later is noted for the use of wooden gabled roofs on adobe walls. Another change from early to late is that building placement shifted from the front of the property line to increasingly further back on the lot to create a zone of separation between public and private.

In Barrio El Hoyo, dwellings are modest in size and scale, with simple massing, ranging from row houses to isolated rectangles and ells. On any given street, flat roofs with parapets alternate with simple gabled, hipped, and shed roofs. The dwellings were built by their owners or by neighbors who worked in the building trades. Adobe continued to be the primary material for bearing walls until after World War II. Typically, the dwelling itself would be adobe, while the kitchen at the rear would be constructed of light wood frame, often using salvaged lumber, even though part of the original construction of the building. Early twentieth-century architectural movements and revivals—principally Craftsman and Mission/Spanish Colonial Revival (or Spanish Eclectic, as used by McAlester and McAlester (1997)—are in evidence, but more as influences on Sonoran than fully realized styles. These influences are subtle: Craftsman influence can be seen in the slatted vents of low-pitched gables; Spanish Eclectic can be seen in the occasional stepped parapet and use of Mission tile.

Building codes or conventions requiring uniform setbacks were unknown and building placement was highly variable. Dwellings were often built up to the street (zero lot line) in the manner of the traditional Sonoran row house, but many have a minimal front setback of 5 to 10 feet. The latter typically have a front fence (usually chain-link, but occasionally masonry and wrought iron) and chairs and benches creating an outdoor living space; the yard is usually swept dirt; flowers are often present, but usually in pots (Manger 2000). This contrasts with the Anglo-American convention, where unfenced front yards are reserved for a lawn (or, increasingly in Tucson, xeric landscaping) and the outdoor living occurs in the back yard. Side setbacks are highly variable, as dwellings were often built on the lot line on at least one side. In some cases, the dwelling is sited at the rear of the lot, like a rural *ranchito*. This is why the dwellings of the barrio are best understood as continuations of the Sonoran tradition (i.e. Sonoran Transitional, with input from contemporaneous Anglo-American modes) rather than as manifestations of specific Anglo-American architectural styles.

The one contributing element of the district that is not in the Sonoran tradition is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St.), a special ministry of the Diocese of Tucson. The chapel was built in 1931 to serve Barrio El Hoyo, and, until the 1960s, held regular Sunday Mass. Today the chapel is used monthly for Masses and regularly for both religious and secular activities, and reflects the traditional religious orientation of the barrio. Architecturally, the chapel was built in simple Mission style, with a low pitch, front-gabled roof edged with red clay-tile at the front to give the impression of a completely tiled roof from the street, projecting eves with exposed rafter ends, smooth stucco

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 4

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

walls painted white, arched window openings, simple visor-roofed porch with red-clay tiles, and a mission-like bell tower.

As a result of the varied responses to the interaction of traditional Sonoran and non-Hispanic American traditions, El Hoyo has a unique feel. It balances the limited urban space and dense lot layout, with a more open atmosphere like a rural village. The streets of Barrio El Hoyo tend to be narrow, noticeably narrower than the Tucson norm. Today, all the street surface asphalt is in good condition, except S. Osborne which is cracked and potholed, although originally they were not paved. The larger streets have space for sidewalks, but no paving of the sidewalks. The narrower streets don't have space where a sidewalk would be. The only paved sidewalk is a small patch in front of the Chapel San Cosme. The paving here is concrete slab, marked USA/WPA and so it is probably contemporary with chapel construction. The absence of sidewalks is very unusual in Tucson and contributes to the rural feel of the area.

El Hoyo is below the general grade of the landscape in surrounding areas to the north, east and south. Along the north edge of the district, Cushing Street is above the floor level of the adjacent houses, W. Simpson Street slopes quite markedly downhill from the east edge of the district, and the roads slope down into El Hoyo from the south. Drainage ditches run along the west side of the district, the ground is relatively level and does not slope into El Hoyo. The streets also have undulations. The undulations, especially the dips, in the road are distinctive; Tucson is generally a very graded town, and so the presence of topography is a noticeable feature of the street-scape. Also Tucson is mostly on a grid, so the angled street layout with few four-way intersections is distinctive and several streets lack traffic signs or even street signs. The narrow streets feel different, almost confined compared to most of Tucson. There is little traffic within the neighborhood, and of necessity it moves slowly.

The diversity of house setbacks along the streets, with some houses at the front property line, others set back a short distance, with others at the rear of the lot, gives the area a more unplanned, open, even rural feel. The traditional religious orientation of the barrio is also reflected in the yard areas, with *nichos* in front yards with Roman Catholic iconography, most often an image of the Virgin of Guadalupe depicted on a small patch of tiles. There is also a painted plaster statue of Our Lady, and one painted mural of her. Other common images depicted in tile are Jesus or angels. The statue and tiles are industrial products, the tiles are printed with the picture, they are not mosaics. These images can be found in other Tucson neighborhoods, but they are more common in El Hoyo, while the scarcity of copper suns, wind chimes, coyotes and cattle motifs commonly seen elsewhere in Tucson, further distinguishes the neighborhood. Quite a few houses had chairs outside along the street for people to sit out on summer evenings; in most of Tucson this is not so.

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 5

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

The vegetation/landscaping is also part of the semi-rural feeling. Although the yard is usually swept dirt, flowers are often present, but usually in pots. There are quite a few tamarisk trees, which need lots of water, and are therefore less common through Tucson. There are also mesquites, palms, and citrus, and, although these are seen throughout Tucson, the trees are less pruned and more natural looking than is typical. There is also a lot of prickly pear, some very large, and, in general, the vegetation grows better in the barrio probably because it is near the river. As Sheridan (1986:240) notes:

because of the proximity of the Río Santa Cruz, the ground was moister and more fertile than in most other parts of town. Vegetation flourished...The impression of still living in the country was particularly strong on winter mornings, when mesquite smoke drifting from the chimneys of wood stoves created a haze that mingled with the mist rising from the floodplain of the river. On those mornings, Anglo Tucson must have seemed very far away indeed.

The best introduction to Barrio El Hoyo is to turn west on Simpson at Main. The most prominent feature is the former Elysian Grove Market (400 W. Simpson St.), built in 1929 by Jose Q. Trujillo at the corner of W. Simpson Street. and S. Samaniego Avenue (Photograph 1). As the local store, this was a pivotal building in the barrio, and became a neighborhood meeting place. Although the store closed in the 1960s, and was converted into three apartments, the conversion retained the original exterior appearance and visually it still is a focal point of the neighborhood. It is a classic example of its type, with the characteristic angled corner entrance. Note that the original signage has been preserved. This building stands at the northeast corner of the former Elysian Grove subdivision, the largest of the barrio's subdivisions. Of the 41 extant buildings in this subdivision that date from the barrio's period of significance, 68.3 percent were built between 1915 and 1930, 19.5 percent between 1936 and 1941, and 12.2 percent between 1946 and 1950. The subdivision consists of four blocks with streets named for prominent Hispanic figures in Tucson's history. Photograph 2 shows a characteristic streetscape in the subdivision, looking down S. Elias Ave. from W. Carrillo St.

El Hoyo's irregular topography is most pronounced in the former Elysian Grove subdivision. On streets like Samaniego and 17th, the difference in grade from the front of the lot to the back was such that builders either had to construct a dwelling with the front at grade and the back raised well above, or they had to dig the front yard down below grade, so that the rear of the structure was at grade. This can be seen in Photograph 3, a view of the south side of W. 17th Street.

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 **Page** 6

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

South of the former Elysian Grove subdivision is Block 245 of the City of Tucson, the oldest part of the barrio. Over half of the 11 dwellings on this block were built in the 1910s. Photograph 4 shows some of these along S. Osborne Street. This photograph illustrates the different building setbacks found throughout the district. In the immediate foreground, 704 S. Osborne Avenue is slightly set back from the street, to the left, 706 (a recent, noncontributing building) is set back further and barely visible, but 708 and 730 are at the street front of their properties. Meanwhile further to the left, 732 and 734 are both set further back on their lots, with 732 not visible in the photograph, and only the front, southeast corner of 734 barely visible.

North of the former Elysian Grove subdivision, in the Southwest and Ball Park subdivisions, are 25 extant buildings dating from the barrio's period of significance, most of which were built in the 1920s and 1930s. Photograph 5 shows S. El Paso Avenue, which runs between these subdivisions. On the right is 400 S. El Paso, one the neighborhood's examples of the Sonoran row house. The slope down into El Hoyo is also apparent. Photograph 6 shows W. Simpson St. On the left is the chapel of San Cosme (546 W. Simpson St), the other major social and visual focal point of Barrio El Hoyo. Note the only paved sidewalk in the district is the small patch in front of the chapel. Also apparent is the irregularity of house placement relative to the street, with 440 W. Simpson set back and completely hidden by the chapel, while 438 is at the street line (although partially hidden by 440's front yard vegetation). The other houses on the left side of the street are all set back from the road and thus completely obscured.

Barrio El Hoyo, together with the National Register-listed Barrio Libre Historic District comprise the locally designated Barrio Histórico Historic District. The City of Tucson has viewed Barrio El Hoyo as having the same architectural and historical importance as the National-Register-listed Barrio Libre. The current nomination is to provide comparable State and National Register recognition of the district's significance.

Assessment of District Integrity

Location

Barrio El Hoyo was formed from three blocks—221, 243, and 245—of the original 1874 Tucson Townsite, a short walk southwest of Tucson's downtown area. Modern development has destroyed some of the original area occupied by the barrio to the north, west and southwest of the district, but the core remains intact. As a result Barrio El Hoyo retains a high degree of integrity of location.

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 7

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

Design

Barrio El Hoyo retains many of the elements that made the original barrio distinctive. The barrio had been almost entirely built up by 1950; very little infill was constructed in the 1950s (5.2 percent of the total number of buildings in the present barrio). During the following two decades, the neighborhood underwent a period of decline and a number of buildings were abandoned and collapsed. In the 1980s, revitalization (or gentrification, depending upon one's perspective) of the barrio began. Buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, the City historic district (historic preservation zone) that contains both Barrio El Hoyo and Barrio Libre (listed on the National Register, October 18, 1978). The development standards are based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines, and are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design. Consequently, while not contributing to the district's integrity, they do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. As a result, Barrio El Hoyo retains a high degree of integrity of design.

Setting

The physical environment within Barrio El Hoyo has seen relatively little change. The ground surface slopes down into the barrio on three sides, and the undulating topography within, remain unchanged. The street layout with its lack of a regular, right-angled grid, as well as the narrow streets themselves also remain unchanged. The area to the east of El Hoyo is a National Register District (Barrio Libre), and while the areas to the north, west and south have been impacted by modern development, none of this development is high-rise buildings which would visually impact El Hoyo. The vegetation also remains much the same, generally more well-watered than areas further from the river, with little evidence of the gravelling used to make the xeric landscaping that has become popular elsewhere in Tucson. Buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico. These standards are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, so the new buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. Overall, Barrio El Hoyo retains high degree of integrity of setting.

Materials

The buildings of Barrio El Hoyo retain much of their original materials, i.e. adobe walls covered in stucco, wooden double-hung sash windows, stone and concrete foundations. Roofing materials,

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 8

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

however, do show considerable variation with composition, asphalt roll, corrugated and sheet metal roofs all being common. However, in most cases, these roofing materials were in use during the district's period of significance and do not detract from the integrity of the structures. Two particularly common impacts on the integrity of the houses of El Hoyo are the use of mechanical cooling systems visible on many of the roof tops and the appearance of iron security bars over the windows. Another significant impact on the integrity of materials is the relatively widespread use of metal chainlink and other non-traditional fencing around yards. Visually, these fences probably represent the most dramatic impact on the integrity of the district. In four cases (4.2%), as a result of high, non-traditional, fences obscuring them, houses are not considered to be contributing elements to the district. Because buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, these buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same materials. These standards have served to reduce the loss of traditional materials in the district despite the loss of historic fabric between 1950 and 1980. Overall, Barrio El Hoyo still retains considerable integrity of materials, although less so in this respect than others.

Workmanship

Barrio El Hoyo is primarily characterized by the Transitional Sonoran style, in which local builders blended traditional Sonoran traditions and with Non-Hispanic American elements. As such, the level of workmanship was originally that of the local Hispanic builders, and has largely remained so to the present. Because buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present, which account for 14.6 percent of the total, have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico and which are applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, the new buildings do not detract from the original elements that made the barrio distinctive, but share many of the same elements. Thus, while they represent loss of original historic fabric, they do not dramatically compromise the integrity of workmanship in the district. Of the older houses, 4 (4.2%) of the buildings in the district were judged to have become noncontributing elements due to inappropriate alterations which do not fall within the range of elements used during the period of significance. Nonetheless, Barrio El Hoyo still retains considerable integrity of workmanship.

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 9

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

Feeling

Barrio El Hoyo retains its feeling as a distinct and different neighborhood within Tucson. It combines the density of a typical urban settlement with a feeling of a more rural village through the combination of street width and layout, building spacing and setbacks, topographic variation, and vegetation. It also retains a feeling of its period of significance through the high proportion of stylistically similar historic buildings and the fact that buildings constructed from the 1980s to the present have been subject to development standards designed to ensure the historic integrity of Barrio Histórico, based on the Secretary of the Interior's Standards and Guidelines. As these have been applied to all construction, whether involving an existing historic building or new design, the result has been the retention of a high degree of the historic and aesthetic feeling despite loss of some historic fabric.

Association

Barrio El Hoyo retains a strong association with the criteria of architecture, and community planning and development, for which it is nominated to the National Register. The historic buildings in Barrio El Hoyo are best characterized as continuations of the Sonoran tradition, with influences from Anglo-American architectural movements and revivals. This architecture of cultural convergence characterizes the survival of the Sonoran tradition in southern Arizona until the middle of twentieth century. Overall, 69.8% of the buildings in the district represent this architectural tradition from its period of significance. In regard to community planning and development, Barrio El Hoyo was essentially self-created and reflects the socioeconomic status of its builders. The barrio was only minimally planned, yet the builders of the barrio, relying for the most part on their own resources, created a unique environment which it still retains today. This survival has been facilitated by the inclusion, since the 1980s, of Bario El Hoyo in Barrio Histórico, the City historic district (historic preservation zone) that contains both Barrio El Hoyo and Barrio Libre (listed on the National Register, October 18, 1978). As a result, the characteristic features of the district have not been compromised by modern development. Consequently, Barrio El Hoyo retains high degree of integritry of association.

Contributing and Noncontributing Buildings

The following list provides the National Register status of all resources within Barrio El Hoyo. Of the 96 buildings in the district, 68 (70.8 percent) are contributing. Noncontributing resources total 28 (29.2 percent); most of these are recently constructed dwellings. Numbered streets are listed consecutively, followed by named streets listed alphabetically. For each entry, the initial date of

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 10

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Description (continued)

construction is also given. Dates are based primarily on data from the Pima County Assessor's property record files, as well as from conversations with long-time residents of the barrio.

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	S. 11th Ave.			
104	715	1908	contributing	
105	719	1911	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
	W. 454 G			
	W. 17th St.			
100	449	1920	noncontributing	Obscured by high fence
079	502	1924	contributing	
101	505	1915	contributing	
080	508	1930	contributing	
083	510	1923	contributing	
084	514	1923	contributing	
087	516	1920	contributing	
088	518	1922	contributing	
090	520	1937	contributing	
091	522	1920	contributing	
094	534	1941	contributing	
095	536	1938	contributing	
098	538	1918	contributing	
	W. 18th St.			
109	508	1915	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 11

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	W. Carrillo	St.		
081	407	1922	contributing	
081	407	1955	_	After period of significance
092	413	1933	noncontributing noncontributing	After period of significance After period of significance
092	431	1948	contributing	After period of significance
085	503	1948	contributing	
089	503 521	1923	contributing	
086	525	1923	contributing	
096	537	1939	contributing	
097	545	1959	noncontributing	After period of significance
077	3 13	1737	noncontributing	Their period of significance
	S. Elias Ave	<u>.</u>		
055	412	1986	noncontributing	After period of significance
056	416	1922	contributing	
041	423	1953	noncontributing	After period of significance
042	427	1928	contributing	
045	431	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
062	432	1925	contributing	
063	434	1920	contributing	
058	436	1925	contributing	
066	438	1924	contributing	
047	441	1982	noncontributing	After period of significance
048	445	1950	contributing	
000	446	1927	contributing	
051	449	1984	noncontributing	After period of significance
039	521	1930	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 **Page** 12

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	S. El Paso A	ave.		
025	400	1927	contributing	
004	403	1924	contributing	
009	421	1930	noncontributing	Moved & obscured by a high wall
005	437	1925	contributing	ingii wan
026	442	1927	contributing	
	S. Osborne	Ave.		
099	704	1915	contributing	
102	706	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
103	708	1915	contributing	
106	730	1919	contributing	
107	732	1936	contributing	
108	734	1930	contributing	
	S. Otero Av	<u>e.</u>		
073	426	1936	contributing	
061	431	1949	contributing	
064	435	1949	contributing	
074	438	1938	contributing	
065	439	1953	noncontributing	After period of significant
067	445	1946	contributing	
075	452	1940	contributing	
076	456	1997	noncontributing	After period of significant
077	460	1951	noncontributing	After period of significant
054	505	1919	contributing	
057	511	1995	noncontributing	After period of significant
060	515	2000	noncontributing	After period of significant
069	529	1915	contributing	

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 **Page** 13

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	W. Rosales	St.		
027	409	1927	contributing	
024	410	1925	contributing	
028	411	1925	contributing	
023	412	1927	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
022	414	2001	noncontributing	After period of significance
029	427	1940	contributing	1
021	428	1946	contributing	
030	429	1925	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
031	431	1935	noncontributing	Most of street façade dates after period of significance
032	433	1925	contributing	until period of significance
019	448	1927	contributing	
	S. Samanieg	go Ave.		
036	420	1918	contributing	
037	428	1919	contributing	
043	550	1925	contributing	
044	552	1994	noncontributing	After period of significance
049	560	1991	noncontributing	After period of significance
050	570	1981	noncontributing	After period of significance

United States Department of the Interior National Park Service

National Register of Historic Places Continuation Sheet

Section Number 7 Page 14

Barrio El Hoyo Historic District Tucson, Pima County, AZ

Survey Site Number	Address	Date of Construction	National Register Status	Reason for Noncontributing Status
	W. Simpson	<u>St.</u>		
007	340	1920	contributing	
008	344	2000	noncontributing	After period of significance
010	350	1925	contributing	1 8
001	357	1909	contributing	
034	400	1929	contributing	
018	402	1940	noncontributing	Inappropriate alterations
035	408	1936	contributing	• •
017	410	1936	contributing	
016	416	1936	noncontributing	Recent addition and high wall obscures dwelling
014	426	1931	contributing	_
015	430	1937	contributing	
013	438	1936	contributing	
012	440	1931	contributing	
052	445	1930	contributing	
053	455	1918	noncontributing	Obscured by high fence
011	546	1931	contributing	